

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
Committee Meeting Minutes
May 23, 2024

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Anita Ortega
2. Annie Koruga (Vice-Chair)
3. Bruce Yow
4. Catherine Callahan
5. Christine Arseneault
6. Clarence R. Fischer
7. Danny Kodmur
8. Daveed Mandell
9. Emily Witkin
10. Herb Hastings
11. Hillary Brown
12. Janice Armigo Brown (2nd Vice-Chair)
13. Roland Wong (Chair)
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of seven (7) in-person BATF members. Emily Witkin used her first “Just Cause,” out of two.

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

- Elena Van Loo
- Ryan Greene-Roesel
- Bob Franklin

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

- Director Robert Raburn
- Dennis Lee (BART Staff)

Alan Chew (BART Staff)
Ahmad Rassai (BART Staff)
Mayra Perez (Captioner)
Bridgett Nolot (Captioner)
Jerry Grace (Guest)
Sam Buman (Guest)
Lucky Maxwell (Guest)
Sara Desumala (Guest)
Aleta Dupree (Guest)
Aaron Morrow (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Aleta Dupree introduced herself as a person with a disability and her disability is not visible. She appreciates Director Robert Raburn attending the BATF meetings faithfully but would like to inform other BART Board of Directors about disability matters on BART. Aleta Dupree mentioned it is important to be engaged and would be nice to have BATF members attend BART of Directors board meetings and give a report on what BATF has been doing. She asked to have an inclusive and expansive concept of the BATF. Aleta Dupree asked to be accepted as who she is as a person.

3. Approval of April 25, 2024 meeting minutes

Herb Hastings moved approval of the April 25, 2024, meeting minutes. Hillary Brown second the motion.

- Motion passes with eleven (11) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention

4. BART Fiscal 25 & Fiscal Year 26 budget update

Alan Chew and Dennis Lee presented on the BART Fiscal Year 25 & 26 Budget update.

Dennis Lee mentioned in FY25 & FY26 BART will continue to deliver reliable, safe, frequent service with a focus on delivering the best ridership experience, while at the same time BART is confronting an extremely challenging financial environment with no permanent operating revenue stability.

He showed a few slides detailing:

- FY25 & FY26 operating budget, ridership forecast update
- FY25 & FY26 operating revenue

- FY25 & FY26 financial assistance
- FY25 & FY26 labor expense
- FY25 & FY26 non-labor expense
- FY25 & FY26 debt service and allocations, five-year outlook, projected fiscal runway,
- FY25 & FY26 capital budget: sources and uses.

Alan Chew went over the timeline and next steps for FY25 & FY26 and mentioned the projected date to get FY25 & FY26 budget adoption is June 13, 2024.

Hillary Brown asked if BART advisory committees is part of the FY25 & FY26 budget. Ryan Greene-Roesel stated the advisory committees budget is included in the Fiscal Year budgets, but it is a very small cost within the operating budgets of several departments.

Clarence R. Fischer mentioned he read there may be a delay with the roll out of Clipper Card 2.0 and asked if this affects the FY25 & FY26 budget. Dennis Lee stated there might be some delay with the Clipper Card 2.0 roll out and the budget may need to be adjusted.

Clarence R. Fischer asked if there is increased revenue from reduced fare evasion from the Next Generation faregates for the FY25 & FY26 budgets. Dennis Lee stated BART has not assumed any kind of increased fare revenue due to fare evasion.

Daveed Mandell asked how much money will be spent on accessibility within the BART system. Alan Chew mentioned for non-labor expense for FY25 & FY26, there's budget for ADA Paratransit. Ahmad Rassai (AR), BART staff, mentioned BART does have a budget for BART's Americans with Disability Act (ADA) and can present at a later meeting to discuss further.

Annie Koruga asked whether tax measures are part of BART's FY25 & FY26 budget. Dennis Lee stated tax measures are not part of the Fiscal Year budget.

Herb Hastings asked if the budget includes fare increase. Dennis Lee mentioned the budget report does include scheduled fare increases for FY25 & FY26.

Aleta Dupree thanked the presenters for presenting. She stated elevators should be budgeted into the Fiscal Year budgets to maintain cleanliness and ongoing maintenance. She stated elevators serve many different situations and should be available for anybody. She hopes the budget will reflect the importance of accessibility within the BART system and added if the elevators are out-of-order, the station is not accessible.

5. Elevator out-of-service updates

- **Out-of-service elevator on BART's webpage for stations**
- **Elevator outage alternatives for all BART stations**

Ryan Greene-Roesel presented on the Elevator out-of-service updates.

She went over the presentation agenda:

- Example out-of-service signage from other jurisdictions
- Types of accessible alternatives at BART
- Proposed sample signs at BART
- Discussion, feedback, and next steps

She showed an example of alternative accessible travel information from New York Subway signage which gives alternative travel when elevator is out-of-service along with phone numbers to call for further assistance.

She went over types of accessible alternatives:

- Redundant, adjacent elevator
 - Example: Ashby BART Station
- Redundant elevator elsewhere in station
 - Example: 12th St/Oakland City Center BART Station
- Backtracking
 - Example: Hayward BART Station
- Walk, roll, or take transit
 - Example: Embarcadero BART Station
- Take transit
 - Example: North Concord BART Station

Ryan Greene-Roesel went over a new signage proposal.

She mentioned temporary signs be posted on elevator doors when elevators are out-of-service.

She went over permanent signs. She mentioned there will be instructional signs at elevators with an attractive alternative:

- Redundant elevator elsewhere in station
- Backtracking available
- Walk, roll, take transit
 - Example: less than 1.5 miles
- Otherwise, customer to contact station agent for assistance
- Start with three stations pilot (Hayward, Downtown Berkeley, 12th Street)

She went over the revised [elevator status](#) page and over accessible alternatives under bart.gov.

She showed different accessible alternatives signs for the 12th St./Oakland City Center and Hayward BART Station that will be posted as part of the pilot program.

She shared the next steps are pilot signage at three BART stations, to develop permanent sign specifications and placement for remaining BART stations, and to fabricate and install permanent signs at the remaining BART stations.

Christine Arseneault mentioned if someone is new to the Bay Area and is not familiar with AC Transit and BART, she suggested to be more specific if using bus system or train system. She gave two examples; AC Transit to AC Transit bus and for Bay Fair to show Bay Fair BART so riders know what kind of transportation they are using.

There was discussion about what to do when an elevator is out-of-order, including elevator mitigation.

Roland Wong suggested to put a sign at the new North end elevator at 19th St. BART station informing riders there is a street elevator on the South end of the station.

Aleta Dupree suggested putting Braille impressions on the signs because not everybody can see the signs. She mentioned this is about being proactive and signs are part of it and elevators should be for everybody.

6. Discuss potential changes to the BATF By-Laws

Roland Wong motioned to have agenda item moved to a later scheduled BATF meeting. Herb Hastings seconded the motion.

Voting passed unanimously amongst appointed BATF members.

7. Member announcements

No member announcements

8. Staff announcements

Elena Van Loo announced Don Queen resigned. She mentioned he was a long time standing BATF member for over twenty years and will be missed.

Elena Van Loo shared that at next month's BATF meeting, staff will present K-Line interlocking construction project update and its bus bridge.

Elena Van Loo stated she reached out to BART staff to look into if there are any restrooms closures and reported there are no restroom closures. She mentioned if you see any restroom closure (s) to report it to BART staff so they can investigate.

Bob Franklin informed BATF members that the BART Bicycle Advisory Task Force (BBATF) will be setting up a table to recruit new members throughout the Bay Area. He also asked BATF members if they would be willing to share the table in order to recruit BATF members and added if interested is to reach out to BART staff.

9. Chairperson announcements

No Chairperson announcements.

10 Future agenda items – member suggest topics

- K-Line interlocking construction project update
 - Bus bridge
 - Ashby, Rockridge, MacArthur, 19th St,
 - Two-year project
- Tactile path
 - Braille
 - Near elevator, escalators, etc.
- Discuss potential changes to the BATF By-Laws
- Elevator mitigation
 - ADA class action law suite
 - What to do when an elevator is out-of-service

11. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 4:16 pm until the next regular meeting, Thursday, June 27, 2024.