



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
 Earthquake Safety Program

Citizens' Oversight Committee Meeting
2013 – 2015 Term

Tuesday, December 3, 2013 4:30 pm

Conference Room 1700
Kaiser Center Tower, Seventh Floor
300 Lakeside Drive, Oakland CA 94612

Meeting Number	Meeting Date	Meeting Time
Term 4, Meeting 5	December 3, 2013	4:30 pm
Attendees	<i>Members</i> Matt Wrona Robert Barksdale Ralph Mason Sayed Sultan <i>Alternates</i> Richard Pipkin Ching Wu Prabhat Goyal	<i>Staff</i> Thomas Horton Molly McArthur Micaela Mazzini
Agenda Item	Action Taken	
<i>Welcome & Introductions</i>	<p>M. McArthur called the meeting to order at approximately 4:35 pm.</p> <p>M. Mazzini noted members' attendance.</p> <p>M. McArthur stated that BART's internal processes related to the Berkeley Hills Tunnel had not been completed as anticipated and that discussion on that topic would be rescheduled for a later date.</p>	





San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
Earthquake Safety Program

<p><i>Review of Administrative Matters</i></p>	<p>M. McArthur reviewed two administrative matters.</p> <p>Adoption of August 6, 2013 Meeting Minutes: the previous meeting minutes were brought to the Committee for adoption. Discussion regarding the lack of questions from the past meeting was a concern.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• R. Mason commented that the meeting minutes did not completely record significant questions and responses, and requested that they be better reflected in the minutes.• R. Barksdale commented that he had several questions regarding the audit process and requested that they be incorporated into the minutes for the August 6th meeting.• The August 6th meeting minutes will be amended and will be redistributed to the Committee for approval.• New protocol was set to deliver minutes to the Committee earlier. <p>Clipper Cards: there was a discussion on the resolution of Clipper Card reimbursement issues.</p>
<p><i>Program Updates</i></p>	<p>T. Horton noted that several projects have completed construction since the last meeting, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Internal Transbay Tube• R-Line Stations• A-Line North Aerial Structures <p>T. Horton stated that several new projects may begin in upcoming months.</p> <p>T. Horton stated that testing on two of three sealant membrane materials for the Transbay Tube had been completed. Due to poor performance of the materials, a steel liner will be used instead of spray-on liner. The steel liner is costlier and will result in a lack of surplus after the Transbay Tube work is completed.</p> <p>T. Horton explained that the program is finalizing the Berkeley Hills Tunnel (BHT) feasibility report. In the future, BART may decide to make this a distinct project and separate it from the Earthquake Safety Program. Funding will have to be secured in the future if BART decides to move forward with the work.</p>



M. McArthur specified that the BHT was not part of the original scope of the Earthquake Safety Program and there was never sufficient funding available.

T. Horton stated that first of three bids for Miscellaneous Structures contracts, had been received. The contract will be presented to the BART Board in January 2014 for authorization.

T. Horton provided additional information about the status of work on the Transbay Tube, noting:

- Retrofit alternatives will need to be determined.
- Work will be performed in portions of the Transbay Tube, not the entire Tube.
- The work is in response to forecasted flow leakage, and is a preventative measure to keep water out of the Transbay Tube in the event of an earthquake.
- Procurement of flatcars will likely be required to perform the work.
- Design of steel liner is in progress and design of pump systems may be performed.

T. Horton stated that three contracts are currently under construction.

T. Horton explained that the area between North Berkeley and Richmond was originally retrofitted for life safety. Recent analysis indicated that all but four of the piers in this area met operability criteria. These four piers have not yet been strengthened and will likely become a separate project. The four piers will undergo operability retrofits and result in the entire line meeting operability conditions. This will provide significant gains for BART including the use of Richmond Yard.

There was a brief discussion about BART's operations under various earthquake scenarios.

C. Wu asked for clarification of the magnitude for "life safety".

T. Horton explained that is 7.0 magnitude on the Hayward and confirmed that the BHT does not meet life safety criteria.



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
Earthquake Safety Program

<i>Financial Report</i>	<p>T. Horton provided an overview of the program’s finances, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The third tranche of the General Obligation Bond has been issued (\$240 million).• The program has expended approximately \$520 million of the project \$980 million total, a rate of roughly \$7 million per month. <p>M. Mazzini explained that the Committee was provided a revised copy of the Financial Report from the August 6, 2013 meeting, as well as the current report.</p> <p>T. Horton reviewed the Financial Report and program schedule, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The Transbay Tube retrofits will be extended piece of work for the next 7-9 years, due to restrictions that only permit limited work hours in the Tube.• The revised costs for the Transbay Tube are not reflected in the current Financial Report since the retrofit alternative has not yet been determined. <p>S. Sultan asked where funds for the new Transbay Tube work will come from.</p> <p>T. Horton stated that those funds will come from the \$112 million management reserve.</p> <p>R. Mason asked for clarification about which stations were currently in construction.</p> <p>T. Horton responded that Orinda, Walnut Creek and Pleasant Hill, San Leandro and Hayward stations were in construction. Work on South Hayward and Fremont will be upcoming. Retrofits at Fruitvale, Coliseum and Bay Fair station will occur in the future.</p> <p>T. Horton explained that to-date cost expenditures were not reflected due to delays in billing.</p>
<i>Other Business</i>	<p>M. McArthur presented dates to determine a meeting schedule for the 2014 year. The Committee agreed to the following dates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Tuesday, February 4, 2013





San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
Earthquake Safety Program

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Tuesday, May 6, 2014• Tuesday, August 5, 2014• Thursday, November 6, 2014 <p>Staff will email the proposed dates to members to finalize the schedule.</p> <p>M. Wrona asked for details about the Report to the Board.</p> <p>M. McArthur stated that information about the Report to Board will be on the agenda for the next COC meeting in February 2014. In general, staff will prepare a draft report and Committee members will provide comments until final concurrence is reached. The Committee Chair will present the report to the BART Board.</p> <p>T. Horton suggested that the Report to the Board be presented by April 2014 to avoid scheduling conflicts with the Board’s schedule.</p> <p>R. Mason asked for information about potential subjects for the next meeting agenda.</p> <p>T. Horton stated that standard agenda topics would be covered and that it was possible that information on the Transbay Tube alternatives, and a summary of the Berkeley Hills Tunnel feasibility study would be available.</p> <p>M. Wrona asked about the availability of a sample audit report that was requested during the previous meeting as well as which Committee member had requested a copy.</p> <p>Staff responded that the audit was available for viewing by Committee members; however, due to proprietary information the information cannot be shared with the public.</p> <p>B. Barksdale was provided copy of the sample audit report and was requested to return it to BART by the end of the week.</p>
<i>Adjournment</i>	M. McArthur adjourned the meeting at approximately 5:30 pm.

